

FILED ENTERED
LODGED RECEIVED

OCT 22 2003

AT SEATTLE
CLERK U.S. DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
BY DEPUTY

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

IN RE: PHENYLPROPANOLAMINE
(PPA) PRODUCTS LIABILITY
LITIGATION,

MDL NO. 1407

This document relates to:

ORDER OF DISMISSAL WITH
PREJUDICE FOR FAILURE TO
COMPLY WITH CMO 6

See Appendix A

THIS MATTER comes before the court on the motion for dismissal with prejudice for failure to comply with court-ordered discovery filed by defendants Bayer Corporation; Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation, and Novartis Corporation; SmithKline Beecham Corporation dba GlaxoSmithKline, GlaxoSmithKline Consumer Healthcare, L.P., SmithKline Beecham Consumer Healthcare, L.P., GlaxoSmithKline Consumer Healthcare, L.L.C. and SmithKline Beecham Holdings Corporation; Block Drug Company, Inc. and Block Drug Corporation (collectively "defendants"). Having reviewed the pleadings filed in support of and in opposition to this motion, the court finds and rules as follows:

I. BACKGROUND

On March 18, 2002, the court entered Case Management Order ("CMO") 6, in which the court set a schedule and protocol for

ORDER

Page - 1 -

01-MD-01407-ORD

1 conducting all case-specific fact discovery within MDL 1407.
2 Specifically, CMO 6 requires each plaintiff in every case to
3 complete a Plaintiff's Fact Sheet ("PFS") and serve it upon
4 defendants within forty-five days of receipt of the PFS. CMO 6
5 also provides that, should a plaintiff fail to serve a PFS within
6 the time allowed, defendants shall send a warning letter and move
7 for appropriate relief if plaintiff fails to respond within
8 thirty days after the warning letter is sent.

9 Defendants now move pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil
10 Procedure 37 and 41 to dismiss the plaintiffs identified in
11 Appendix A of this order for failure to comply with CMO 6.
12 Various plaintiffs filed oppositions to defendants' motion.¹

13 II. DISCUSSION

14 Before dismissing a case for non-compliance with court-
15 ordered discovery, the court must weigh five factors: (1) the
16 public's interest in expeditious resolution of litigation; (2)
17 the court's need to manage its docket; (3) the risk of prejudice
18 to the defendants; (4) the public policy favoring disposition of
19 cases on their merits; and (5) the availability of less drastic
20 sanctions. Malone v. United States Postal Serv., 833 F.2d 128,
21 130 (9th Cir. 1987).

22
23
24 ¹ In response to some oppositions, defendants filed a second
25 revised motion for dismissal, withdrawing their motion as to
26 certain plaintiffs. Therefore, this order does not address those
plaintiffs who have been voluntarily withdrawn from defendants'
motion to dismiss.

1 The plaintiffs subject to defendants' motion to dismiss were
2 served with a PFS on or before April 15, 2003. See Defs.' Mot.,
3 Attach. A. The fact sheets were due on or before May 30, 2003.
4 Id. Defendants sent warning letters to the plaintiffs asking for
5 completed fact sheets. Id.

6 Plaintiffs proffer a variety of excuses for their failure to
7 comply with CMO 6, including, inter alia, the difficulty in
8 locating clients, the debilitating nature of the injuries at
9 issue, and their obligations under CMOs 13 and 15. Additionally,
10 a number of plaintiffs object to dismissal based on their submis-
11 sion of a PFS. However, most of these individuals submitted a
12 PFS only *after* defendants filed their motion to dismiss. At no
13 time prior to the filing of defendants' motion did any of the
14 plaintiffs at issue request additional time in which to complete
15 a PFS from either defendants or the court. Additionally, the
16 court notes that plaintiffs' CMO 13 and 15 obligations stem from
17 their own choice to file mass-joinder cases against numerous
18 defendants.

19 Accordingly, the court finds that dismissal is appropriate
20 in light of the factors set forth in Malone. First, both the
21 public's interest in the expeditious resolution of litigation and
22 the court's need to manage its docket dictate dismissal. Many of
23 the cases subject to this order have been on file for close to or
24 over a year. During that time, plaintiffs have not moved their
25 cases forward. Such lack of diligence does not serve the public
26 interest in expeditious resolution of litigation. See Yourish v.

1 California Amplifier, 191 F.3d 983, 990 (9th Cir. 1999) ("dis-
2 missal in this instance serves the public interest in expeditious
3 resolution of litigation as well as the court's need to manage
4 the docket because Plaintiff's noncompliance has caused the
5 action to come to a complete halt, thereby allowing Plaintiff to
6 control the pace of the docket rather than the Court").

7 Second, the unreasonable delay in completing the fact sheets
8 prejudices the defendants' ability to proceed with the cases
9 effectively. The PFS is designed to give each defendant the
10 specific information necessary to defend the case against it.
11 Without that discovery device, a defendant is unable to mount its
12 defense because it has no information about the plaintiff or the
13 plaintiff's injuries outside the allegations of the complaint.
14 The unreasonable delay in producing this information, therefore,
15 severely prejudices the defendants, warranting dismissal.

16 Pagtalunan v. Galaza, 291 F.3d 639, 642-43 (9th Cir. 2002).

17 Third, inasmuch as the disposition of cases should be on the
18 merits, here, in light of the inability of many of the named
19 plaintiffs to provide any information regarding the critical
20 elements of their claims, it is impossible to dispose of the
21 cases on the merits. Plaintiffs are uniquely in the possession
22 of the information being sought. Their inability or unwilling-
23 ness to furnish this information in a timely fashion is not
24 excusable. See In re Exxon Valdez, 102 F.3d 429, 433 (9th Cir
25 1996) ("policy [of disposing cases on their merits] lends little
26 support to appellants, whose total refusal to provide discovery

1 obstructed resolution of their claims on the merits.") Also, for
2 those plaintiffs who only belatedly provided fact sheets, defen-
3 dants describe these fact sheets as insufficient and incomplete.

4 Last, there are no less drastic sanctions remaining. All of
5 the named plaintiffs received warning letters from defendants.²

6 These letters prompted no response. The court already imposed
7 the sanction of preventing remand of the cases where discovery
8 requirements have not been met. See CMO 10 ¶ 2 (Nov. 21, 2002).

9 The court also ordered that the time for completing case-specific
10 discovery will not begin to run until a substantially complete
11 PFS has been provided to defendants. Id. ¶ 3. And now, even at
12 the doorstep of dismissal, many of the named plaintiffs still
13 fail to comply with CMO 6. Where the court has been lenient and
14 provided plaintiffs with second and third chances following
15 procedural defaults, "further default[] may justify imposition of
16 the ultimate sanction of dismissal with prejudice." Malone, 833
17 F.2d at 132 n.1 (quoting Callip v. Harris County Child Welfare
18 Dep't, 757 F.2d 1513, 1521 (5th Cir. 1985)).³

20 ² Counsel for plaintiff Irvin Malone assert that they did
21 not receive a warning letter from defendants and urge the court
22 to accept Malone's late filed PFS for this reason. However,
23 because plaintiff provides no excuse whatsoever for his late
filing, the mere assertion that counsel did not receive a warning
letter does not justify his submission of a PFS after defendants
filed their motion to dismiss.

24 ³ Objections were also lodged as to two plaintiffs who
25 timely submitted a PFS in particular cases. The court agrees
26 that the claims of plaintiff Dorothy Warren should be dismissed
for her failure to serve a PFS in the matter of Everidge v. Bayer

1 Accordingly, the court finds it appropriate to dismiss
2 plaintiffs' claims against all defendants with prejudice. For
3 the foregoing reasons, defendants' motion to dismiss for failure
4 to comply with court-ordered discovery is GRANTED. The claims by
5 the plaintiffs listed in Appendix A are DISMISSED against all
6 defendants with prejudice.

7 DATED at Seattle, Washington this 22 day of OCTOBER, 2003.

8
9 

10 BARBARA JACOBS ROTHSTEIN
11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

24 _____
25 Corp., et al., No. 02-1858 (as opposed to the PFS she submitted
26 in Rowe v. Bayer Corp., et al., No. 02-1857). Also, the claims
of Rosetta Marrero in the matter of Rowe are appropriate for
dismissal given the ambiguous and insufficient PFS submitted.

ORDER

REVISED ATTACHMENT A TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR DISMISSAL

Bayer, Block, GSK, and Novartis' Plaintiffs

Cases with Delinquent Fact Sheets Subject to Dismissal for Failure to Comply with CMO-6

State	Case Name	Plaintiff Name	MDL Docket Number	Date PFS Served	Date PFS Due	Warning
Alabama	Glover- Joyce	Glover- Joyce	C02-2588	3/24/2003	5/5/2003	5/12/2003
Alabama	Johnson- Ernest Vel	Johnson- Ernest Vel	C03-0197	4/7/2003	5/22/2003	5/29/2003
Alabama	Waters- Gregory	Cordner- Terry	C02-0019 (now C03-1406)	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/16/2002
California	Shubin- Alex	Shubin- Alex	C02-0521	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
California	Wischmeyer- Ronald	Wischmeyer- Ronald	C02-0523	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Ackel- Leslie	Amar- Ciera	C02-1856	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/2/2002
Louisiana	Ackel- Leslie	Amar- Shacara	C02-1856	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/2/2002
Louisiana	Ackel- Leslie	Amar- Vidal	C02-1856	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/2/2002
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Allgrunn- Jeremy	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Anderson- Clifton	C02-2375 (now C03-1550)	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Anderson, Jr.- Leon	C02-2375 (now C03-1549)	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Blakes- Charlie	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Carter- Willie Mae	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Dillard Jr.- Al	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Dillard Jr.- Saul	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Epps- Patricia	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Evans- Clint Jr.	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Hardman- Melvina	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Hollingsworth- Blanchard	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Hoover-Travis	C02-2375 (now 03-1990)	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Howard- Elizabeth	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Lafayette- Kenneth	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	McCoy- Donnie	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Mitchell- Connie	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Oliver- Mary B.	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Smith- Janie o/b/o Larry D. Smith	C02-2375 (now C03-1670)	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Patterson- Gracie	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Pinnix- Evelyn	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Savage- Frank	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Savage- Joana	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Smith- Larry	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Williams- James B.	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Adams- Barbara	Williams- Jessie	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Andry- Kathleen	Andry- Warren	C02-0776	4/8/2002	5/24/2002	6/18/2002, 6/26/2002, 7/26/2002
Louisiana	Ashley- Angela	Jackson- Winfield	C02-0790	4/8/2002	5/24/2002	6/17/2002, 10/30/2002, 11/4/2002
Louisiana	Ashley- Billy	Ashley- Daisy	C03-1541	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Ashton- Joyce	Johnson- Brittany	C02-1860	10/16/2002	12/2/2002	5/12/2003

REVISED ATTACHMENT A TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR DISMISSAL

Bayer, Block, GSK, and Novartis' Plaintiffs

Cases with Delinquent Fact Sheets Subject to Dismissal for Failure to Comply with CMO-6

State	Case Name	Plaintiff Name	MDL Docket Number	Date PFS Served	Date PFS Due	Warning
Louisiana	Ayers- Mable	Ayers- Mable	C02-1767	6/25/2002	8/9/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Ballard- Helen	Ballard- Helen	C03-1791	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Bates- Melvin	Bates- Melvin	C03-1554	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Battiste- Mary	Battiste- Mary	C03-1760	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Beals- Emanuel	Landry- Regina (Individually)	C02-0787	4/8/2002	5/24/2002	6/17/2002, 11/4/2002
Louisiana	Beals- Emanuel	Landry- Sumar	C02-0787	4/8/2002	5/24/2002	6/17/2002
Louisiana	Bickham- Barbara	Bickham- Barbara	C03-1560	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Bickham- Clarice	Pierre- Gwendolyn	C02-0907	5/21/2002	7/5/2002	8/23/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Burbel- Edward	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Coleman- Shelby Sr.	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Gooseberry- Lee	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	McBride- Marie	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Swain- Melford Jr.	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Walker- Jane	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burbel- Edward	Watts- Marshall	C02-0258	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Burton- Elizabeth	Burton- Elizabeth	C03-2205	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Bush- Cynthia	Bush- Cynthia	C03-2203	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Byrd- Mike	Burns- Brady Scott	C02-2371	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Byrd- Mike	Este- Richard John	C02-2371	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Byrd- Mike	Pierre- Gwendolyn	C02-2371	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Byrd- Mike	Self- Delmer Deloris	C02-2371	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Cain- Mitchell	Cain- Mitchell	C03-2037	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Carroll- Vera Mae	Carroll- Vera Mae	C03-2032	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Coleman- Rosie	Coleman- Bobby	C02-2375	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Colvin- Billy	Colvin- Billy	C02-2155	3/24/2003	5/8/2003	5/12/2003
Louisiana	Corbin- John	Corbin- John	C02-1745	7/2/2002	8/16/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Cupstid- Milton	Cupstid- Milton	C03-2201	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Davis- Clara	Davis- Clara		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Davis- Jim	Davis- Jim	C02-1021	6/6/2002	7/22/2002	8/14/2002, 8/20/2002, 9/18/2002
Louisiana	Davis- Ruby	Davis- Ruby	C03-1770	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Davis- Shellie	Davis Jr.- Shellie	C03-1894	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	DeLoach- Robert	DeLoach Jr.- Robert	C03-1768	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Earl- Clara (1)	Messerole- Deanne	C02-1367	7/26/2002	9/9/2002	6/17/2002, 11/4/2002
Louisiana	Earl- Clara L.	Earl- Clara L.	C02-2150	12/6/2002	1/20/2003	3/10/2003
Louisiana	Edwards- Emma	Edwards- Emma	C03-1766	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Everidge- Betty	Warren- Dorothy	C02-1858	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/2/2002
Louisiana	Everidge- Betty	Weiss- Kevin	C02-1858	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/6/2002
Louisiana	Farley- Arlene	Farley- Arlene		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003

REVISED ATTACHMENT A TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR DISMISSAL

Bayer, Block, GSK, and Novartis' Plaintiffs

Cases with Delinquent Fact Sheets Subject to Dismissal for Failure to Comply with CMO-6

State	Case Name	Plaintiff Name	MDL Docket Number	Date PFS Served	Date PFS Due	Warning
Louisiana	Fleming- Althea	Fleming- Althea	C02-1750	7/2/2002	8/16/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Frank- Timothy	Frank- Timothy	C02-1779	7/2/2002	8/16/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Garcie- Joe	Garcie- Joe	01-2055	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Harmon- Jewell	Harmon- Jewel E.	C03-2199	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Harris- Minnie	Ford- Johnny	C03-1905	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Howard- Elizabeth	Howard- Elizabeth	C03-1975	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Isgitt- Lillian	Isgitt- Lillian Sue	C03-1831	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Johnson- Liticia	Johnson- Liticia	C02-1765	9/9/2002	10/24/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Jones- Billy Ray	Jones- Billy Ray	C03-1496	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Kane- Katherine	Kane- James	C03-1477	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Lafayette- Kenneth	Lafayette- Kenneth		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Lambremont- Robert	Lambremont- Robert	C02-1746	7/2/2002	8/16/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Landry- Annie	Landry- Annie	C02-1859	10/16/2002	12/2/2002	12/17/2002
Louisiana	Landry- Annie	Martin- Gloria	C02-1859	10/16/2002	12/2/2002	12/17/2002
Louisiana	Landry- Annie	Metzler- Earl	C02-1859	10/16/2002	12/2/2002	12/17/2002
Louisiana	Leatherman- Kelvin	Leatherman- Kelvin	C02-1759	5/21/2002	7/5/2002	7/29/2002
Louisiana	Lee- Robert	Lee- Robert	C02-1727	6/25/2002	8/9/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Lewis- Frank Joseph	Lewis- Frank Joseph	C03-1498	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Malveaux- Rayfield	Miles- Denoy	C02-2372	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Maxie- Francie	Maxie- Francie		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	McCullough- Ellen	Businelle- Brenda	C02-2595	3/11/2003	4/25/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	McCurley- Vicky	McCurley- Vicky	C02-2153	3/24/2003	5/8/2003	5/12/2003
Louisiana	McNeal- Clarice	McNeal- Clarice	C03-1501	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Metevia- Jacqueline	Metevia- Jacqueline	C02-1756	5/21/2002	7/5/2002	7/29/2002
Louisiana	Miley- Fred	Miley- Fred	C03-1776	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Monk- Henry	Monk- Henry	C01-1795	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Moore- Malvine	Moore- Malvine	C01-2058	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Montgomery- Charles	Montgomery- Charles	C03-1502	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Norwood- Agatha	Norwood- Agatha	C02-1758	5/21/2002	7/5/2002	7/29/2002
Louisiana	Pennywell- M.J.	Pennywell- M.J.		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Pier- Margie	West- Essie	C02-2373	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Register- Earl	Register- Earl	C02-2149	12/6/2002	1/20/2003	3/10/2003
Louisiana	Richardson- Stella	Richardson- Stella	C03-1778	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Rodriguez- Anaise	Rodriguez- Annise	C03-1485	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Rollins- Betty	Rollins- Betty	C02-1736	6/25/2002	8/9/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Rowe- Renita	Marrero- Rosetta	C02-1857	10/4/2002	11/18/2002	12/6/2002
Louisiana	Saverin- Dora	Rout- Rosemary	C02-2594	3/24/2003	5/8/2003	5/12/2003
Louisiana	Saverin- Dora	Saverin- Dora	C02-2594	3/24/2003	5/8/2003	5/12/2003
Louisiana	Savoie- Charlene	Savoie- Charlene	C02-1738	6/25/2002	8/9/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Scott- Kathy	Garner- Laverne		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Scott- Samuel	Scott- Samuel		3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Seal- Christine	Seal- Christine	C03-1486	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003

REVISED ATTACHMENT A TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR DISMISSAL

Bayer, Block, GSK, and Novartis' Plaintiffs

Cases with Delinquent Fact Sheets Subject to Dismissal for Failure to Comply with CMO-6

State	Case Name	Plaintiff Name	MDL Docket Number	Date PFS Served	Date PFS Due	Warning
Louisiana	Smith- Duncan	Smith- Duncan	C03-1784	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Smith- Jacqueline	Smith- Charlie	C03-1673	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Smith- Janie	Smith- Larry D.	C03-1670	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Smith- Juanita	Bradford- Clyde	C03-1963	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Spears- Virginia	Spears- Virginia	C03-1786	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Stevenson- Louretha	Stevenson- Louretha	C01-2009	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Stevenson- Louretha	Stevenson- Renee	C01-2009	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Temple- Loretta	Magallan- Janette	C02-0911	5/21/2002	7/5/2002	7/29/2002, 8/23/2002
Louisiana	Thomas, Sr.- Lionel	Thomas, Sr.- Lionel	C02-1754	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Thomas- Loretta	Thomas- Loretta	C03-2185	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Timmons- Gloria	Timmons- L.T.	C03-1654	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Victor- Rummell	Victor- Rummell	C02-1733	9/13/2002	10/28/2002	11/4/2002, 4/15/2003
Louisiana	Washington- John	Washington- John	C02-1744	7/2/2002	8/16/2002	11/4/2002
Louisiana	Washington- Ollie	Washington- Ollie	C03-1788	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	4/1/2003
Louisiana	Williams- Annie B.	Williams, Annie B.	C01-2069	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Louisiana	Williams- Beatrice	Williams- Beatrice	C02-1761	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Louisiana	Williams- Jacqueline	Williams- Jacqueline	C03-1508	1/30/2003	3/17/2003	3/28/2003
Louisiana	Wilson- Glenda Gale Gonzaque	Gonzague-Wilson- Glenda Gale	C03-1950	3/6/2003	4/21/2003	5/9/2003
Louisiana	Wright- Louis	Wright- Louis	C01-2073	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Minnesota	Oakes- Tracey	Oakes- Tracey	C02-2063	11/13/2002	12/30/2002	1/13/2003
Mississippi	Brisco- James	Brisco- James	C02-2608	3/11/2003	4/25/2003	5/9/2003
Mississippi	Ingram- Florence	Burrage- Fannie	C02-2533	3/11/2003	4/25/2003	5/9/2003
Mississippi	Ingram- Florence	Latiker- Sarah	C02-2533	3/11/2003	4/25/2003	5/9/2003
Mississippi	Ingram- Florence	Roby- Lillie	C02-2533	3/11/2003	4/25/2003	5/9/2003
Mississippi	Malone- Irvin	Malone- Irvin	C03-0210	3/24/2003	5/8/2003	5/12/2003
New Jersey	Maynard-Eddie	Maynard-Eddie	C03-0429	4/8/2003	5/22/2003	5/29/2003
New Mexico	Jones- Raymond	Jones- Raymond	C03-0438	4/15/2003	5/30/2003	6/12/2003
New York	DeLatta- Laura	Hains- Bernie	C02-0363	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
New York	DeLatta- Laura	Reta- John	C02-0363	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/15/2002
Tennessee	Anderson- Virginia	Anderson- Virginia	C02-0284	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Tennessee	Bell- Joy	Bell- Joy	C02-0369	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002
Tennessee	Bell- Richard	Bell- Richard	C02-0370	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	10/18/2002
Tennessee	Doggett- Martha	Doggett- Martha	C02-0368	3/21/2002	5/6/2002	5/14/2002